Social Equity Era, Sustainable and Smart Growth

Elizabeth Baca, MD, MPA
Senior Health Advisor
Governor’s Office of Planning and Research

March 16, 2018
My road to policy

- Federally Qualified Health Center
- Low-income population
- Many challenges to live a healthy life
  - Many children were not healthy

Photo: Ravenswood Family Health Center
Paradigm Shift

Asthma
Depression
Obesity
High Cholesterol
Type 2 Diabetes

Photo: Ravenswood Family Health Center

Programs, Letters, Community Training
We can not solve our problems with the same level of thinking that created them

Albert Einstein
National Context
Preface

Our founders wrote, that all people are created equal with the right to

“life, liberty and the pursuit of happiness.”

Equality and equal opportunity are deeply rooted in our national values, wherein everyone has a fair shot to succeed with hard work.
The Committee

- James Weinstein (chair)
- Hortensia de los Angeles Amaro
- Elizabeth Baca
- B. Ned Calonge
- Bechara Choucair
- Alison Evans Cuellar
- Robert Dugger
- Chandra Ford
- Robert García
- Helene Gayle
- Andrew Grant-Thomas
- Sister Carol Keehan
- Christopher Lyons
- Kent McGuire
- Julie Morita
- Tia Powell
- Lisbeth Schorr
- Nick Tilsen
- William Wyman
The Robert Wood Johnson Foundation asked the committee to:

Review the state of health disparities in the United States and explore the underlying conditions and root causes contributing to health inequity and the interdependent nature of the factors that create them.

Identify and examine a minimum of six examples of community-based solutions that address health inequities, drawing both from deliberate and indirect interventions or activities that promote equal opportunity for health, spanning health and non-health sectors accounting for the range of factors that contribute to health inequity in the US (e.g., systems of employment, public safety, housing, transportation, education).

Identify the major elements of effective or promising solutions and their key levers, policies, stakeholders, and other elements that are needed to be successful.

Recommend elements of short- or long-term strategies and solutions that communities may consider to expand opportunities to advance health equity.

Recommend key research needs to help identify and strengthen evidence-based solutions and other recommendations as viewed appropriate by the committee to reduce health disparities and promote health equity.
Health Disparities: differences that exist among specific population groups in the attainment of full health potential and in incidence, prevalence, mortality, and burden of disease and other adverse health conditions.

Health Equity: the state in which everyone has the opportunity to attain full health potential and no one is disadvantaged from achieving this potential because of social position or any other socially defined circumstance.
A. Health equity is crucial for the wellbeing and vibrancy of communities. *Chapter 1 & 2*

B. Health is a product of multiple determinants. *Chapter 3*

C. Health inequities are in large part a result of poverty, structural racism, and discrimination. *Chapter 3*

D. Communities have agency to promote health equity. *Chapters 4 & 5*

E. Supportive **public and private policies (at all levels)** and programs facilitate community action. *Chapter 6*

F. The collaboration and engagement of new and diverse (multi-sector) partners is essential to promoting health equity. *Chapter 7*

G. Tools and other resources exist to translate knowledge into action to promote health equity. *Chapter 8*
Nine Community Examples

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Magnolia Place Community Initiative</td>
<td>Los Angeles, CA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Harlem Environmental Action (WEACT)</td>
<td>New York, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blueprint for Action</td>
<td>Minneapolis, MN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dudley Street Neighborhood Initiative (DSNI)</td>
<td>Boston, MA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandela MarketPlace (MMMP)</td>
<td>Oakland, CA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Delta Health Center (DHC)</td>
<td>Mound Bayou, MS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People for Sustainable Housing (PUSH)</td>
<td>Buffalo, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastside Promise Neighborhood (EPN)</td>
<td>San Antonio, TX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indianapolis Congregation Action Network</td>
<td>Indianapolis, IN</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Social Determinants - why social equity matters

Image from Communities in Action: Pathways to Promote Health Equity
Policies to support community solutions

**Recommendation**
All government agencies involved in planning related to land use, housing, transportation, and other important areas should:

- Add requirements to ensure robust and authentic community participation in policy development.
- Collaborate with public health agencies to ensure consideration of unintended consequences for health and well-being.
- Highlight the co-benefits of considering health equity in comprehensive plans.
- Prioritize affordable housing and implement strategies to mitigate and avoid displacement and document outcomes.
Background with General Plan Guidelines and Recent Update
Acknowledgements

Thanks also to:

AARP | Air Resources Board | Alliance of Regional Collaboratives for Climate Adaptation (ARCCA) and member regions | American Lung Association | American Planning Association | Association of Bay Area Governments | Association of Environmental Professionals | CalEPA | California Air Pollution Control Officers Association | California Association of Counties of Government | California Coastal Commission | California Conference of Local Health Officers | California Department of Conservation | California Department of Education | California Department of Finance | California Department of Food and Agriculture | California Department of Forestry and Fire Protection | California Department of Housing and Community Development | California Department of Public Health | California Department of Resources Recycling and Recovery | California Department of Technology | California Department of Toxic Substance Control | California Department of Water Resources | California Health and Human Services Agency | California Natural Resources Agency | California Office of Emergency Services | California Pan Asian Health Network | California Planning Roundtable | California Water | Caltrans | Caltrans Aeronautics | Central California Regional Obesity Prevention Program | ChangeLab Solutions | Climate Readiness Institute at UC Berkeley | ClimateReady | Community Health Councils, Los Angeles County | County Health Executives Associate of California | Design 4 Active Sacramento | Eco-Adapt | ED West Fresno Family Resource Center | Environmental Protection Agency | Federal Emergency Management Agency | Fresno Interdenominational Refugee Ministries | Fresno Metro Ministries | Governors Office of Business and Economic Development | Health in All Policies Taskforce | Institute for Local Government | Kaiser Innovation Lab | League of California Cities | Local Government Commission | Local Health Districts | Massachusetts Institute of Technology | Metropolitan Transportation Commission | Migrant Health Institute | Mosquito Abatement Districts | National Institute for Standards and Technology | Native American Heritage Commission | National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration | Office of Statewide Health Planning and Development | Pacific Gas and Electric | Place Works | PolicyLink | Prevention Institute | Public Health Institute | Raimi & Associates | Resources Legacy Fund | Sacramento Tree Foundation | Safe Routes to School National Partnership | San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District | Sierra Health Foundation | Strategic Growth Council | The California Endowment | The Leadership Council | The Nature Conservancy | UC Berkeley, Center for Technology and Aging | UC Davis | UC Los Angeles | United States Army Corps of Engineers | United States Department of Agriculture | United States Geological Survey | US Department of the Interior | Walk Sacramento | White House Council on Environmental Quality | The Staff and Interns at the Office of Planning and Research | Participants who gave of their time to provide feedback at the many sessions throughout the state, and the many more who submitted comments to OPR.
GPG- A lot of outreach!

Years of outreach and meetings
- State partners, local and regional partners, community groups and more
- Planners across the state
- National grants, state-wide collaboration
- Public review
- New legislation
- Recent Release- And more outreach coming on SB 1000

Active Living & Recreation
Food Systems
Social Cohesion & Safety
Health & Economic Opportunity
Climate & Resiliency
Healthy Housing
Environmental Health & Exposures
Health & Human Services
New Legislation - SB 1000

- Have more robust discussion in Chapter 3 on Community Engagement
- Moved required sections into Chapter 4 for Required Elements
- Modified and moved up Equitable and Resilient Communities to Chapter 5
- Chapter 6 is Healthy Communities
Community Engagement and Outreach

- Design process from beginning
- Advisory boards and novel ways to integrate partners
- Culture and equity considerations
- Data
- Tools
Levels of Community Engagement

- Traditional planning engagement falls on the consult and involve spectrum.

- Principles:
  - Inclusion
  - Transparency
  - Democratic participation
Air Quality

Introduction

Chronic exposure to air pollutants is a serious health risk to millions of California residents, particularly the young, elderly, and people with heart disease and respiratory problems. Safeguarding public health has been the primary focus of federal and state air quality legislation and activities for many years. Air pollution also impacts local economies by damaging agricultural crops, natural vegetation, buildings, and other exposed materials. In addition, the economic health of an area may be affected adversely if insufficient air quality improvement triggers more stringent federally mandated air pollution controls. Air pollution also can impair visibility and obscure views. Cities and counties should strive to reduce emissions for the benefit of both their own residents and those of other communities in their region and the state as a whole. Air quality can be greatly improved through a multi-prong approach.

Local jurisdictions have responsibility for land use planning and can also significantly affect the design, creation, and management of development and the local circulation system. While air pollution is a regional issue, local governments have an opportunity to address air quality issues through general plans, development ordinances, local circulation systems, transportation services, and other plans and programs. As such, they are uniquely positioned to contribute to the local air district’s efforts to achieve and maintain compliance with state and federal air quality standards. Supporting mode shift through improved bicycle and pedestrian facilities and support for transit, building infrastructure for zero emission vehicles, reducing parking, and promoting infill development can help reduce emissions and improve air quality. Cities and counties within the San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District (SVAPCD) jurisdictions are required by state law to include air quality measures in their general plans. The SVAPCD developed the Air Quality Guidelines for General Plans to assist these cities and counties in meeting these requirements. The document provides additional goals, policies, and programs for adoption in general plans that will reduce vehicle miles traveled and improve air quality. In addition to statutory requirements for air quality measures in the San Joaquin Valley, cities and counties that have identified disadvantaged communities, as defined by SB 1000, must also incorporate air quality into their general plans. For more information on the environmental justice requirements, see the 111 section. Regardless of statutory requirements, the benefits of adopting an air quality element or implementing air quality policies throughout a general plan are universal.

Government Code 65350.23(c):

The adoption of air quality amendments to a general plan to comply with the requirements of subdivision (d) shall include all of the following:

(1) A report describing local air quality conditions including air quality monitoring data, emission inventories, lists of significant source categories, attainment status and designations, and applicable state and federal air quality plans and transportation plans.

• Divided into 2 sections, for SJV (required) and all other communities

• New focus on air quality in disadvantaged communities
Near Roadway Air Exposure

Extended section on considerations and mitigation strategies for air quality near high volume roadway

Include strategies to:

- Reduce traffic emissions
- Increase dispersion of emissions
- Remove pollution from air
Equitable & Resilient Communities

- Definitions of social equity
- Incorporating social equity
- Data, mapping, example local areas
- Resilience screen
Social equity definitions

The National Academy of Public Administration defines social equity as:
“The fair, just, and equitable management of all institutions serving the public directly or by contract; the fair, just and equitable distribution of public services and implementation of public policy; and the commitment to promote fairness, justice, and equity in the formation of public policy.

The American Planning Association defines social equity as:
"The expansion of opportunities for betterment that are available to those communities most in need, creating more choices for those who have few."

The California Planning Roundtable states that social equity:
“Ensures that all groups enjoy the benefits of a healthy and prosperous community, with access to housing, transportation, jobs and commerce. It enables a variety of businesses to flourish.”

Sources:
http://www.napawash.org/fellows/standing-panels/social-equity-in-governance.html
https://planning.org/policy/guides/adopted/redevelopment.htm
http://reinventingthegeneralplan.org/principles/
Healthy Communities

• Innovative Partnerships

• Health Considerations
  – In addition to EJ section
  – Health & Economics
  – A Changing Climate & Resilience
  – Social Connection & Safety
  – Health & Human Services

• Data & Policies
Community Benefit and Other Data

- **Community Health Needs Assessment:** This free web-based platform was created to assist community hospitals doing their needs assessment and provides census level data for health, economic, social, environmental, and behavioral data.

- **California Environmental Health Tracking Program:** This program is hosted by the CDPH. The data is more focused on environmental health impacts such as air quality, health, climate change related outcomes, water quality, and cancer prevalence.

- **Envirostor:** the Department of Toxic Substances Control hosts this program. It is a database that provides data in a GIS form to identify contaminated sites as well as facilities that deal with hazardous waste. This resource is important for remediation and siting.

- **CalEnviroScreen:** The Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA) in the California Environmental Protection Agency created this online mapping tool. It is a tool that can help identify communities that are burdened with high levels of pollution and/or are highly vulnerable to its effects. The tool also contains socioeconomic data.

- **Healthy Communities Data and Indicators Project (HCI):** the California Department of Public Health (CDPH) hosts HCI. This indicator list provides evidence for links to health outcomes, data sources, and provides the ability to create maps.

- **California Health Interview Survey (CHIS):** The largest state health survey in the nation, CHIS is a random phone interview administered by the UCLA Center for Health Policy in conjunction with the State Department of Public Health and the Department of Health Care Services. CHIS recently added new functions, available at the neighborhood level in certain jurisdictions, on health behaviors and conditions of relevance to planning for healthy communities.
Review SB 1000 Statute—currently in Chapter 4
Chapter 4: Environmental Justice

Environmental Justice Element

Introduction
Over 3 million Californians are exposed to and at risk from high pollution, according to the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment’s Cal Enviroscreen tool. In addition to examining environmental hazards, Cal Enviroscreen and other tools look at assets that help protect communities from poor health. Legislation adopted in 2016, Senate Bill 1000, now requires both cities and counties that have disadvantaged communities to incorporate environmental justice (EJ) policies into their general plans, either in a separate EJ element or by integrating related goals, policies, and objectives throughout the other elements. This update, or revision if the local government already has EJ goals, policies, and objectives, must happen “upon the adoption or next revision of two or more elements concurrently on or after January 1, 2018.”

Government Code Section 65302(h)
(1) An environmental justice element, or related goals, policies, and objectives integrated in other elements, that identifies disadvantaged communities within the area covered by the general plan of the city, county, or city and county, if the city, county, or city and county has a disadvantaged community. The environmental justice element, or related environmental justice goals, policies, and objectives integrated in other elements, shall do all of the following:
(A) Identify objectives and policies to reduce the unique or compounded health risks in disadvantaged communities by means that include, but are not limited to, the reduction of pollution exposure, including the improvement of air quality, and the promotion of public facilities, food access, safe and sanitary homes, and physical activity.
(B) Identify objectives and policies to promote civil engagement in the public decision-making process.
(C) Identify objectives and policies that prioritize improvements and programs that address the needs of disadvantaged communities.
(2) A city, county, or city and county subject to this subdivision shall adopt or revise the environmental justice element, or the environmental justice goals, policies, and objectives in other elements, upon the adoption or next revision of two or more elements concurrently on or after January 1, 2018.
(3) By adding this subdivision, the Legislature does not intend to require a city, county, or city and county to take any action prohibited by the United States Constitution or the California Constitution.
The fair treatment of people of all races, cultures, and incomes with respect to the development, adoption, implementation, and enforcement of environmental laws, regulations, and policies
(h) (1) An environmental justice element, or related goals, policies, and objectives integrated in other elements, that identifies disadvantaged communities within the area covered by the general plan of the city, county, or city and county, if the city, county, or city and county has a disadvantaged community.
SB 1000- Government Code 65302 (h)

The environmental justice element, or related environmental justice goals, policies, and objectives integrated in other elements, shall do all of the following:

(A) Identify objectives and policies to reduce the unique or compounded health risks in disadvantaged communities by means that include, but are not limited to

- the reduction of pollution exposure, including the improvement of air quality
- the promotion of public facilities
- food access
- safe and sanitary homes
- physical activity
SB 1000- Government Code 65302 (h)

The environmental justice element, or related environmental justice goals, policies, and objectives integrated in other elements, shall do all of the following:

(B) Identify objectives and policies to promote civil engagement in the public decision making process

(C) Identify objectives and policies that prioritize improvements and programs that address the needs of disadvantaged communities.
Timing

(2) A city, county, or city and county subject to this subdivision shall adopt or review the environmental justice element, or the environmental justice goals, policies, and objectives in other elements, upon the adoption or next revision of two or more elements concurrently on or after January 1, 2018.

(3) By adding this subdivision, the Legislature does not intend to require a city, county, or city and county to take any action prohibited by the United States Constitution or the California Constitution.
SB 1000- Government Code 65302 (h)

Definitions

(4) For purposes of this subdivision, the following terms shall apply:

(A) “Disadvantaged communities” means an area identified by the California Environmental Protection Agency pursuant to Section 39711 of the Health and Safety Code or an area that is a low-income area that is disproportionately affected by environmental pollution and other hazards that can lead to negative health effects, exposure, or environmental degradation.

(B) “Public facilities” includes public improvements, public services, and community amenities, as defined in subdivision (d) of Section 66000.

(C) “Low-income area” means an area with household incomes at or below 80 percent of the statewide median income or with household incomes at or below the threshold designated as low income by the Department of Housing and Community Development’s list of state income limits adopted pursuant to Section 50093.
## Indicators

### Exposure Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Air Quality: Ozone</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Air Quality: PM2.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diesel Particulate Matter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drinking Water Contaminants</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pesticide Use</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toxic Releases from Facilities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traffic Density</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Indicators

### Environmental Effect Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cleanup Sites</th>
<th>Groundwater Threats</th>
<th>Hazardous Waste Generators and Facilities</th>
<th>Impaired Water Bodies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image1" alt="Cleanup Sites Icon" /></td>
<td><img src="image2" alt="Groundwater Threats Icon" /></td>
<td><img src="image3" alt="Hazardous Waste Generators and Facilities Icon" /></td>
<td><img src="image4" alt="Impaired Water Bodies Icon" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Solid Waste Sites and Facilities</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image5" alt="Solid Waste Sites and Facilities Icon" /></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Indicators

### Sensitive Population Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Image</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Asthma</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Asthma" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cardiovascular Disease</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Cardiovascular Disease" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low Birth Weight Infants</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Low Birth Weight Infants" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Socioeconomic Factor Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Image</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Educational Attainment</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Educational Attainment" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing Burden</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Housing Burden" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linguistic Isolation</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Linguistic Isolation" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poverty</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Poverty" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Unemployment" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What Next? Thinking Differently
Great Opportunity for Local Government Innovation

Food Waste Prevention

The Governor released a letter on March 5th, 2018 in support of "Food Waste Prevention Week" and OPR, in collaboration with the California Department of Food and Agriculture, CalRecycle, the Strategic Growth Council, the California Department of Public Health, the University of California, Division of Agriculture and Natural Resources, The Southern California Public Health Alliance, and many other state, local, and private sector partners, is pleased to announce March 5th through 9th, 2018, as "Food Waste Prevention Week" in the State of California.

OPR's Work and the Broader Food System, Including Food Waste Work

Food Access

In 2016, the Legislature passed and Governor Brown signed Senate Bill 1000 (Levy, Chapter 587), requiring cities and counties that have disadvantaged communities to incorporate environmental justice (EJ) policies into their General Plans, either in a separate EJ element or by integrating related goals, policies, and objectives throughout the other elements. This update, or revision if the local government already has EJ goals, policies, and objectives, must happen "upon the adoption or next revision of two or more elements concurrently on or after January 1, 2018."

One of the policy areas local jurisdictions with disadvantaged communities will have to address includes food access. The updated General Plan Guidelines have a discussion and explain how land use planning policies can be incorporated at the local level to support food access including:
- Zoning to streamline projects
- Protect agricultural land
- Supporting urban farms

Food to Share as a Healthy Community and Environmental Justice Case Study

The Food to Share program is now operating through a growing network of food donors and recipient organizations that Metro has encouraged, connected, and continues to facilitate to keep working together to meet food needs.
Great Opportunity for Local Government Innovation

Food System 6.0 Accelerator

a public/private initiative accelerator details

Great Opportunity for Local Government Innovation

Climate Change Action: An Opportunity to promote sustainable, healthy, resilient and equitable communities.
As We Think About What Is Next

“Development that meets the needs of the present **without compromising** the ability of **future generations** to meet their own needs”

UN World Commission 1987
Thank You

Elizabeth Baca, MD, MPA
Senior Health Advisor
Governor’s Office of Planning & Research
Elizabeth.Baca@opr.ca.gov

Sources:
National Academy of Sciences, Communities in Action
Cal Enviroscreen
General Plan Guidelines, OPR